

Limestone District School Board
Administrative Report



Report to: Board of Trustees

From: Dave Fowler, Manager of Facility Services
Charlyn Downie, Planning Officer
Paul Babin, Superintendent of Business Services

Subject: **Ministry of Education – Public Release of School Facility Condition Data**

Date: August 31, 2016

Objectives:

To provide Trustees with an update about the Ministry of Education's release of Facility Condition Index information.

History:

In August 2016 the Ministry of Education released the Facility Condition Index (FCI) for all Ontario schools. FCI is a benchmark used by the Ministry to compare the relative condition of schools across the Province. Information on school conditions are gathered in five-year cycles, the last of which took place from 2011 to 2015 (a new cycle is currently underway).

To get detailed information, the Ministry hired independent, third-party facility inspectors. Each assessment team is comprised of two engineers — one with expertise in building design and construction, and the other with expertise in building systems (e.g., mechanical and electrical). The inspectors review essential components and systems for each school building. They also review wear and tear to building interiors. Renewal needs by each school were identified during this investigation and recorded by the assessment team in a provincial database known as VFA Facility.

The FCI index reviews the costs of facility renewal needs in relationship to the cost of replacing the building. It is expressed as a percentage using this formula – 5-year renewal costs divided by the current facility replacement value.

A school with a low FCI rating needs less repair and renewal needs than a school with a higher FCI rating. However, a school with a higher FCI percentage does not indicate that the school is unsafe or that the wellbeing of students and staff is endangered. Schools are monitored regularly for health and safety issues by on site staff. Each facility is also inspected regularly for maintenance issues by Board Facility Services staff. As well, third party professionals are often employed to inspect some areas of the schools, such as roofs.

Limestone District School Board (LDSB) also published FCI data in the Long Term Accommodation Plan which was presented in May 2016. This plan was produced by Ameresco Asset Sustainability Group Inc. and the FCI information in this report also came from the provincial VFA Facility database.

Observations:

There is a difference between the FCI released by the Ministry and the version found in the Long Term Accommodation Plan (LTAP) that is both acceptable and expected.

The FCI released by the Ministry is based upon renewal needs over a five-year window. For example, if a school was assessed in 2012, total renewal needs identified in the VFA Facility database for 2012, 2013, 2014, 2015 and 2016 would be added together.

In the Ministry public release, a number of LDSB schools were assessed by Ministry inspectors over different years, such as 2012, 2013 and 2014. Meaning, the five-year window of renewal needs would not be consistent for all LDSB schools in the Ministry public release data.

More information on the Ministry FCI data release can be found at:
http://www.edu.gov.on.ca/eng/parents/renewal_data.html

In contrast, the LTAP covers renewal needs over a 10-year window for all LDSB schools to the school year 2020-2021.

As such, FCI data concerning the same school facility will be different due to the time windows chosen by the Ministry and in the LTAP prepared by Ameresco.

An example – Yarker Family School

The assessment year for this school was 2012 and the Ministry release of FCI data for this school identifies \$404,219 of school renewal needs for the five-year period (2012 to 2016) with a FCI index of 20%.

The LTAP presented by Ameresco for this school identifies \$856,638 for school renewal needs for a ten-year period to the 2020-2021 school year with an FCI index of 42.52%.

Appendix A highlights the school renewal needs for Yarker Family School and the different time windows chosen by the Ministry and Ameresco in presenting the data.

Table - Comparison of FCI data for all schools

A table is provided in Appendix B listing all LDSB schools and comparing the Ministry release of FCI data to the FCI data released as part of the LTAP.

With the public release of the FCI data, the Ministry also issued a technical paper to explain the assessment program, definitions and other information useful in understanding the assessment data. In this document the Ministry also acknowledged that a school board may choose to use an FCI over an interval of time that is not consistent with the Ministry's 5-year baseline, for example an interval of shorter (e.g. 3 years) or longer (e.g. 10 years).

It is important to note that certain schools were not assessed by Ministry inspectors, such as new schools that are less than five years of age.

The Ministry next assessment five-year-cycle is currently underway and is for the period 2016 to 2020.

Recommendations:

That this report be received as information.

This report was reviewed by:



Paul Babin
Superintendent of Business Services



Debra Rantz
Director of Education

**Ministry of Education -Public Release of Facility Condition Data
Appendix A- Comparison of Ministry Data to Limestone DSB (LTAP) Data**

Yarker Family School

<u>Requirement/Event</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>Cost</u>	<u>Cumulative</u>	<u>FCI</u>
D302099-Heat Generating - Other	2012	\$ 10,847	\$ 10,847	
D502001-Lighting and Branch Wiring - Branch Wiring	2012	\$ 7,762	\$ 18,608	
G2040-Site Development	2012	\$ 32,540	\$ 51,148	
G302005-Sanitary Sewer - Septic Tanks	2012	\$ 8,677	\$ 59,825	
G204001-Site Development - Fencing and Gates	2013	\$ 27,116	\$ 86,941	
D304007-Distribution Systems - Exhaust Systems	2013	\$ 10,847	\$ 97,788	
D501003-Electrical Service and Distribution - Main Switchboard	2013	\$ 34,915	\$ 132,703	
D501003-Electrical Service and Distribution - Main Switchboard	2013	\$ 21,693	\$ 154,396	
G302005-Sanitary Sewer - Septic Tanks	2013	\$ 37,963	\$ 192,359	
D202001-Domestic Water Distribution - Pipes and Fittings	2014	\$ 10,847	\$ 203,205	
B2010-Exterior Walls	2014	\$ 8,677	\$ 211,883	
C302015-Floor Finishes - Vinyl Sheet	2014	\$ 5,423	\$ 217,306	
D2010-Plumbing Fixtures	2014	\$ 10,227	\$ 227,533	
D2020-Domestic Water Distribution	2014	\$ 10,847	\$ 238,379	
D5020-Lighting and Branch Wiring	2014	\$ 15,525	\$ 253,904	
D502001-Lighting and Branch Wiring - Branch Wiring	2014	\$ 43,386	\$ 297,290	
D502005-Lighting and Branch Wiring - Exit Lighting and Signs	2015	\$ -	\$ 297,290	
B2030-Exterior Doors	2015	\$ 8,677	\$ 305,967	
B2030-Exterior Doors	2015	\$ 5,785	\$ 311,752	
C103002-Fittings - Washroom Accessories	2015	\$ 18,439	\$ 330,191	
C103009-Fittings - Millwork	2015	\$ 28,472	\$ 358,663	
C302005-Floor Finishes - Carpet	2015	\$ 8,677	\$ 367,340	
D202001-Domestic Water Distribution - Pipes and Fittings	2015	\$ 17,354	\$ 384,694	
G2040-Site Development	2015	\$ 8,677	\$ 393,372	
C1020-Interior Doors	2016	\$ 10,847	\$ 404,219	
				20% Ministry FCI - 5 Years
C1030-Fittings	2017	\$ 9,340	\$ 413,558	
C103018-Fittings - Window Coverings	2017	\$ 16,624	\$ 430,182	
C301005-Wall Finishes - Paint	2017	\$ 7,456	\$ 437,638	
C301005-Wall Finishes - Paint	2017	\$ 3,275	\$ 440,913	
C301005-Wall Finishes - Paint	2017	\$ 3,275	\$ 444,188	
C303006-Ceiling Finishes - Paint	2017	\$ 7,570	\$ 451,758	
D3060-Controls and Instrumentation	2017	\$ 7,455	\$ 459,213	
G2040-Site Development	2017	\$ 17,842	\$ 477,055	
G2050-Landscaping	2017	\$ 14,844	\$ 491,899	
G30-Site Mechanical Utilities	2017	\$ 334,283	\$ 826,182	
G301001-Water Supply - Well Systems	2017	\$ 14,886	\$ 841,068	
G40-Site Electrical Utilities	2017	\$ 12,913	\$ 853,981	
D503001-Communication and Security - Fire Alarm	2019	\$ 652	\$ 854,633	
D502004-Lighting and Branch Wiring - Exterior Lighting	2020	\$ 2,000	\$ 856,633	
D503099-Communication and Security - Other	2020	\$ 5	\$ 856,638	
				42.52% LTAP FCI - 10 Years

Notes-The Building replacement value for this school is \$2,014,789

Ministry of Education - Public Release of Facility Condition Data									
Appendix B - Comparison of Ministry Data to Limestone DSB (LTAP) Data									
School Name	Replacement Value (\$)	Assessment Year	Ministry of Education		Limestone DSB				
			August 2016 - Public Release	Facility Condition Index 5 Years	May 2016 -LTAP Release (prepared by Ameresco)	Facility Condition Index 10 Years			
			5 Year Renewal Needs (\$)	Facility Condition Index 5 Years	10 Year Renewal Needs (\$)	Facility Condition Index 10 Years			
Amherst Island	2,014,789	2012	1 821 282	90%	2,230,850	110.72%			
Amherstview PS	11 240 039	2012	4 777 573	43%	8,549,000	78.24%			
Bath PS	8 075 620	2012	2 245 226	28%	5,798,620	71.80%			
Bayridge PS	8 415 211	2013	3 471 425	41%	6,420,840	76.30%			
Bayridge SS	21 770 237	2013	8 220 049	38%	13,187,100	60.57%			
Catarqui Woods ES	8 808 085	2013	318 963	4%	1,621,390	18.41%			
Centennial PS	7 500 582	2014	1 211 577	16%	4,547,240	60.63%			
Central PS	5 232 855	2014	1 792 050	34%	3,073,930	58.74%			
Centreville PS	3 945 629	2012	1 750 367	44%	3,947,930	100.06%			
Clarendon Central PS	2 298 619	2013	1 243 753	54%	1,625,060	70.70%			
Collins Bay PS	6 342 397	2012	3 130 816	49%	4,220,550	66.50%			
École Sir John A. Macdonald Public School		Not Assessed	-	-					
Eiginburg & District PS	6 316 694	2013	1 803 557	29%	3,602,260	57.03%			
Enterprise PS	4 058 361	2012	1 761 988	43%	4,067,860	100.51%			
Ernestown SS	23 379 629	2012	14 052 725	60%	22,537,100	96.40%			
Fairfield ES	9 196 864	2012	2 925 043	32%	4,095,380	44.53%			
Frontenac SS	28 984 974	2013	4 229 036	15%	9,446,540	32.59%			
Glenburnie PS	5 857 261	2013	1 593 168	27%	3,109,800	53.09%			
Harrowsmith PS	7 699 773	2013	2 344 133	30%	6,274,840	81.49%			
James R Henderson PS	10 927 362	2013	2 933 263	27%	5,320,230	48.69%			
John Graves Simcoe PS	5 857 261	2014	1 635 459	28%	3,446,500	58.84%			
Joyceville PS	6 383 192	2013	2 237 252	35%	3,854,330	60.38%			
Kingston C & VI		Not Available			25,910,600	88.75%			
La Salle SS	24 807 807	2013	7 593 363	31%	17,324,700	69.84%			
Lancaster Drive PS	8 081 309	2013	1 103 363	14%	4,709,420	58.28%			
Land O Lakes PS	5 721 825	2013	2 304 856	40%	3,211,560	56.13%			
Lord Strathcona PS	5 842 271	2014	2 581 552	44%	3,300,490	56.49%			
Loughborough PS	11 278 695	2013	1 669 477	15%	4,148,870	36.78%			
Loyalist C & VI (Sec)	32 252 598	2014	15 080 177	47%	21,312,800	66.08%			
Marysville PS	2 072 355	2014	323 914	16%	933,851	45.06%			
Napanee DSS	35 627 553	2012	10 226 700	29%	21,966,500	61.66%			
Newburgh PS	4 589 242	2012	2 009 257	44%	2,556,000	55.70%			
North Addington Education Centre (Sec)	21 649 749	2013	8 376 080	39%	31,748,800	146.65%			
Odessa PS	14 666 335	2012	5 986 183	41%	8,990,270	61.30%			
Perth Road PS	6 353 252	2013	2 190 103	34%	4,915,030	77.36%			
Polson Park PS	8 310 622	2014	1 252 953	15%	2,397,310	28.85%			
Prince Charles PS	6 330 212	2013	3 025 990	48%	5,107,300	80.68%			
R Gordon Sinclair Memorial PS	6 342 397	2014	2 461 614	39%	3,469,230	54.70%			
Rideau Heights PS	9 196 864	2014	4 056 496	44%	5,668,710	61.64%			

Ministry of Education - Public Release of Facility Condition Data									
Appendix B - Comparison of Ministry Data to Limestone DSB (LTAP) Data									
	Replacement Value	Assessment Year	Ministry of Education		Limestone DSB				
			August 2016 - Public Release		May 2016 -LTAP Release (prepared by Ameresco)				
School Name	(\$)		5 Year Renewal Needs (\$)	Facility Condition Index 5 Years	10 Year Renewal Needs (\$)	Facility Condition Index 10 Years			
Rideau PS	10 597 859	2014	2 985 673	28%	8 028,180	75.75%			
Selby PS	6 600 964	2012	4 809 493	73%	6,294,200	95.35%			
Southview Public School		Not Assessed	-	-					
Storrington PS	6 307 070	2013	2 022 744	32%	5,761,060	91.34%			
Sydenham HS	24 046 192	2013	5 713 728	24%	13,022,200	60.76%			
Sydenham PS	4 589 242	2014	1 990 004	43%	4,698,350	102.38%			
Tamworth PS	5 468 713	2012	3 089 207	56%	4,998,240	91.40%			
The Prince Charles PS	10 452 112	2012	3 010 988	29%	6,619,910	63.34%			
Truedell PS	6 056 473	2014	1 286 477	21%	2,603,460	42.99%			
W. J. Holsgrove PS	3 302 016	2013	1 063 788	32%	2,085,040	63.14%			
Welborne Avenue PS	10 133 059	2014	3 182 337	31%	7,140,930	70.47%			
Winston Churchill PS	6 628 383	2014	1 924 137	29%	3,253,680	49.13%			
Yarker Family School	2 014 789	2012	404 219	20%	856,638	42.52%			

Notes -

Ministry FCI 5 Years includes renewal events from Assessment Year + 4 years (example 2012 assessment year + 4 years = 2016)
 LTAP FCI 10 Years includes renewal events to the school year 2020-2021